The authorities on elephant biology, elephant welfare, captive elephant management, and zoo development, undersigned.

C/- 17 Ellen Avenue
Keilor East
Victoria 3033
Australia

Mayor Mr. Len Brown len.brown@aucklandcouncil.govt.nz
Councillor Deputy Mayor Ms. Penny Hulse penny.hulse@aucklandcouncil.govt.nz
Councillor Mr. Michael Goudie michael.goudie@aucklandcouncil.govt.nz
Councillor Mr. Wayne Walker wayne.walker@aucklandcouncil.govt.nz
Councillor Dr. Cathy Casey cathy.casey@aucklandcouncil.govt.nz
Councillor The Hon. Chris Fletcher chris.fletcher@aucklandcouncil.govt.nz
Councillor Mr. Des Morrison des.morrison@aucklandcouncil.govt.nz
Councillor Ms. Sharon Stewart sharon.stewart@aucklandcouncil.govt.nz
Councillor Mr. Arthur Anae arthur.anae@aucklandcouncil.govt.nz
Councillor Mr. Calum Penrose calum.penrose@aucklandcouncil.govt.nz
Councillor Sir John Walker john.walker@aucklandcouncil.govt.nz
Councillor Mr. Richard Northey richard.northey@aucklandcouncil.govt.nz
Councillor Ms. Ann Hartley ann.hartley@aucklandcouncil.govt.nz
Councillor Mr. George Wood george.wood@aucklandcouncil.govt.nz
Councillor Mr. Cameron Brewer cameron.brewer@aucklandcouncil.govt.nz
Councillor Ms. Penny Webster penny.webster@aucklandcouncil.govt.nz
Councillor Ms Sandra Coney sandra.coney@aucklandcouncil.govt.nz
Councillor Mr. Michael Lee mike.lee@aucklandcouncil.govt.nz
Councillor Ms. Noelene Raffills noelene.raffills@aucklandcouncil.govt.nz

20 May 2011

Your Honour the Mayor and Councillors,

In September last year we wrote you (copy attached) regarding the Auckland Zoo’s plan to acquire additional Asian elephants. We are now writing again to urge you not to support the Zoo’s plans, and to express our deep concerns regarding misleading information posted on the Auckland Zoo website.

Of particular concern to us is the Auckland Zoo’s statement that it intends to source elephants from Sri Lanka. The situation for elephants in that country is highly complex. There is a range of pressures on wild populations there, against a background of deep cultural engagement with elephants. Sri Lanka is emerging from a long civil war, yet there are many local voices urging strong action to protect elephants.

After lengthy and careful consideration, we are convinced that removing elephants from Sri Lanka at this time, whatever the motives, is not helpful in any way to securing better outcomes for elephants in that island nation. The sense, in much of Asia, that elephants can be treated as livestock, as commodities, works actively against efforts to promote elephant welfare and conservation. On these grounds alone we urge the Council not to support Auckland Zoo’s plans.

Furthermore, the importation of young elephants, whether from the wild or captive born, must inevitably involve the breaking of social bonds with family and peers. Such social disruption is highly damaging for elephants, causing them lasting trauma.

The Zoo’s failed experiment with providing its sole elephant Burma a horse as a companion animal calls into question its knowledge of elephants.

The Zoo claimed that there is similarity in the social structures of the two species. Current scientific knowledge about the social life of both horses and elephants shows this idea to be entirely fanciful.
Elephants and horses are extremely different; the Zoo was simply misleading the Council and the New Zealand public.

The Zoo states that it now plans to “bring in two elephants” and to build “a family group of 10 elephants through breeding”. The Zoo does not state how it would achieve this breeding objective but plans may include highly manipulative, costly and invasive artificial breeding techniques that do not in any way advance conservation of the species.

It should also be noted that breeding in zoos has produced a disproportionate ratio of male calves to female calves. Bull elephants have different social needs from cows and require different management strategies. No urban zoo in the world has yet succeeded in providing adequate social conditions for the development of young bull elephants, most of whom are consigned to live in social isolation in very costly high-security facilities.

We note here that the Zoo and Aquarium Association of Australasia’s “Guidelines for the management of elephants in Australasian Zoos” requires any facility keeping elephants to have a minimum of 4 cow elephants in order to provide for basic social life. If implemented, Auckland Zoo’s plans could not be expected to meet these standards for many years.

The Zoo argues that in the past its elephants Kashin and Burma have helped raise “three quarters of a million dollars to fund conservation projects for endangered animals in the wild”. Apart from obvious questions about how such a statement can be justified, it indicates clearly the true cost-benefit of holding elephants, at great costs to their welfare, in an urban setting.

- The Zoo estimates the cost of new facilities for elephants to be $10million and the cost of importation to be around $3million.
- The annual cost of maintaining an elephant in a zoo is generally accepted to be not less than $100,000.
- The cost to hold 3 elephants would be at least $300,000 and, for a group of 10, not less than $1million.

Lastly, we would particularly like to draw your attention to a decision taken recently by city authorities in Toronto, Canada. There the City Council faced a very similar situation to the one you are facing: the need to decide whether to incur the high cost of the redevelopment of expanded elephant facilities necessary for minimum acceptable living conditions, or to place the Zoo’s last three remaining elephants in better facilities, in a more hospitable climate elsewhere. The Council and the Zoo have decided that the most prudent course of action is to send the elephants elsewhere and for the Toronto Zoo to no longer keep elephants.

We urge the Council not to proceed to support the acquisition of Asian elephants by Auckland Zoo. The elephant Burma should be sent to live with other elephants in an open-range zoo or sanctuary.

Yours sincerely,

Mr. Will Travers, Chief Executive Officer, Born Free Foundation, Horsham, UK
will@bornfree.org.uk  http://www.bornfree.org.uk/

Mr. Adam Roberts, Executive Vice President, Born Free Foundation USA, Washington DC, USA
adam@bornfreeusa.org  http://www.bornfreeusa.org/

Dr. Cynthia Moss, Director, Amboseli Trust for Elephants, Kenya
cmoss@elephanttrust.org  http://www.elephanttrust.org/

Dr. Keith Lindsay, Amboseli Trust for Elephants, Oxford, UK
wklindsay@googlemail.com  http://www.elephanttrust.org/
Dr. Joyce Poole, Director, ElephantVoices, Norway and Kenya  
jpoole@elephantvoices.org  http://www.elephantvoices.org/

Mr. Petter Granli, Director, ElephantVoices, Norway and Kenya  
pgranli@elephantvoices.org  http://www.elephantvoices.org/

Ms. Pat Derby, President, Performing Animals Welfare Society, California, USA  
patderby@sbcglobal.net  http://www.pawsweb.org/

Ms. Carol Buckley, Chief Executive Officer, Elephant Aid International, Tennessee, USA  
carol@elephantaidinternational.org  http://www.elephantaidinternational.org/

Ms. Catherine Doyle, Director, Elephant Campaign, In Defense of Animals, Los Angeles, California, USA  
davidkca@earthlink.net  http://www.idausa.org/

Ms. Isabella McCrea, Oceania Regional Director, International Fund for Animal Welfare, Sydney, Australia  
imccrea@ifaw.org  http://www.ifaw.org/ifaw_asia_pacific/

Mr. Eliot Pryor, SAFE, New Zealand  
eliot@safe.org.nz  http://www.safe.org.nz/

Mr. Bob Kerridge, Executive Director, SPCA Auckland, New Zealand  
Bob.kerridge@spca.org.nz  http://www.spca.org.nz/

Ms. Bridget Vercoe, Country Manager, WSPA, New Zealand  
BridgetVercoe@wspa.org.nz  http://www.wspa.org.nz/

Dr. Mel Richardson, Captive Wildlife Veterinary Consultant, Paradise, California, USA  
Doctormel1950@sbcglobal.net

Mr. David Hancocks, Architect and Design Consultant, Melbourne, Australia  
dhan8403@bigpond.net.au

Ms. Lisa Kane JD, Coalition for Captive Elephant Wellbeing, Seattle, Washington, USA  
lisafkane@hotmail.com

Ms. Amy Mayers, Vision Communications, Washington DC, USA  
ammcomms@rcn.com

Mr. Peter Stroud, Zoological Consultant, Melbourne, Australia  
pcestroud@mac.com  http://www.zootica.com
Dear Councillor,

We the under-signed are writing to you about the recent decision of the Auckland City Council to support the expansion of the Auckland Zoo to allow the acquisition of additional Asian elephants. We urge you to reconsider this decision in light of the following information:

1. **No urban zoo in the world can adequately cater to the needs of elephants.** Sound science tells us that elephants are social animals that spend their lives in and around families of closely related individuals, moving across vast areas. Family life cannot be created in a zoo and there is growing evidence that simply placing unrelated elephants together does not simulate natural social life. Urban zoos can neither provide sufficient space for elephants, nor sufficient environmental complexity.

2. **Importation is highly expensive and logistically complex.** Auckland Zoo could only acquire additional elephants by importing them from overseas. The only sources are existing zoo breeding programs or populations of elephants in the Asian countries in which elephants live naturally.

3. **Removing elephants from existing zoo programs will neither assist the sustainability of zoo elephant populations nor assist the welfare of the elephants involved.** Existing zoo populations of Asian elephants, internationally, are not self-sustaining because of a combination of insufficient genetic diversity and skewed age structure.

4. **Removing elephants from Asian countries is unethical.** The recent importation of elephants from Thailand to Australia revealed a range of issues including the current impossibility of proving that imported elephants are actually captive born and not plundered from the wild.

5. **The attempted importation of elephants to New Zealand would generate great international controversy.** The good name of both the City of Auckland, and of New Zealand as a country, will be damaged.

6. **Building for urban elephants is always more expensive than initially estimated.** Even attempting to create basic living conditions for a “herd” of elephants in Auckland Zoo will be extremely expensive. The estimate of $NZ13 million is almost certainly an under-estimate. The National Zoo in Washington has recently spent an astonishing $US50 million on basic and inadequate facilities for a proposed total of nine elephants. In Australia, the Melbourne Zoo and Sydney’s Taronga Zoo each spent in excess of $AU15 million.

7. **Elephants are very expensive to keep.** The ongoing maintenance of elephants in urban zoos has been estimated to cost not less than $NZ100,000 per specimen per year, not including the maintenance of facilities and capital depreciation. To maintain a “herd” of 10 elephants, not less than $NZ1,000,000.00 per annum should be allocated.

8. **Urban elephants are NOT a sound investment.** It has been demonstrated that elephants in an urban zoo are not a permanent draw-card sustaining high zoo visitation over time. The birth of elephant calves can result in peaks in visitor numbers but over time such attractions fade and in the long-term they are not cost-effective.

9. **Elephants do not fit the Auckland City “brand”.** Elephants can be readily experienced in many places around the world and their presence in Auckland Zoo would not enhance Auckland or New Zealand as a destination for visitors.

We urge you to reconsider the Council’s decision to support the acquisition of Asian elephants by Auckland Zoo. The elephant Burma, should be sent to live with other elephants in an open-range zoo or sanctuary.

Yours sincerely,

**Mr. Will Travers**, Chief Executive Officer, Born Free Foundation, Horsham, UK
will@bornfree.org.uk

**Mr. Adam Roberts**, Executive Vice President, Born Free Foundation USA, Washington DC, USA
adam@bornfreeusa.org